1 2 3 4	Final - Minutes Microscopic Hair Comparison Case Review Subcommittee of the Forensic Science Board August 27, 2018
5	Department of Forensic Science, Central Laboratory, Classroom 1
6 7 8 9	Subcommittee Members Present Vince S. Donoghue, Essex Commonwealth's Attorney (Designee of Senator Mark D. Obenshain, Chair of the Senate Courts of Justice Committee) – Subcommittee Chair
10	David Lett, Esq.
11 12 13	Lieutenant Colonel Tracy Russillo, Deputy Superintendent, Virginia State Police (Designee of Colonel Gary T. Settle, Superintendent, Virginia State Police)
14	Staff Members Present
15	Amy M. Curtis, Department Counsel
16	Katya N. Herndon, Chief Deputy Director (participated by telephone)
17	Carisa M. Studer, Legal Assistant
18	Jennifer L. Taylor, Administrative Assistant
19	John D. Taylor, Tammistative Hoolstane
20	Call to Order by Subcommittee Chair Vince Donoghue
21	Can to Order by Subcommittee Chair Time Bonognae
22 23	Mr. Donoghue called the meeting of the Microscopic Hair Comparison Case Review Subcommittee ("Subcommittee") to order at 1:30 p.m.
24	
25	Adoption of Agenda
26 27 28 29 30	The Chair asked if there were any additions or changes to the draft agenda for the meeting. Being none, Lt. Col. Russillo made a motion to adopt the agenda, which was seconded by Mr. Lett and adopted by unanimous vote of the Subcommittee.
31	Approval of Draft Minutes of the November 15, 2016 Meeting
32 33 34 35 36 37	The Chair asked if there were any changes or corrections to the draft minutes from the November 15, 2016 meeting. Being none, Lt. Col. Russillo made a motion to adopt the minutes, which was seconded by the Chair. Mr. Lett abstained. The November 15, 2016 minutes were approved by majority vote of the Subcommittee.
38	<u>Discussion</u>
39 40 41 42	Amy Curtis, Department Counsel, discussed with the Subcommittee the due diligence parameters of the Microscopic Hair Comparison Case Review project for the Department of Forensic Science ("DFS" or "the Department") and Forensic Science Board ("Board").
43 44 45 46	Ms. Curtis explained to the Subcommittee various roadblocks she has encountered while conducting research for conviction orders and testimony transcripts for the project. The Department's law student intern, and Jennifer Taylor, Administrative Assistant have sent

47 numerous letter to Circuit Court Clerks' offices inquiring about conviction orders and transcripts.

48 The responses have been varied.

Ms. Curtis and the Subcommittee discussed whether using the Court's online dispositions for not guilty verdicts and *nolle prosequi* cases is sufficient due diligence in those circumstances rather than asking court clerks to send copies of those disposition orders. The Subcommittee suggested calling the clerks' offices to attempt to get a verbal confirmation over the phone, and the attempt to confirm the disposition telephonically should be noted for those cases.

Katya Herndon, Chief Deputy Director, is going to reach out to Karl R. Hade, Executive Secretary of the Supreme Court of Virginia to ask about accessing the Supreme Court's court management system for researching disposition information and defense attorney names.

Ms. Curtis and the Subcommittee discussed the difficulty in obtaining transcripts from the courts and court reporters. In many cases, the Clerks' offices have indicated they do not have a copy of the transcripts and refer DFS to the court reporter. Court reporters have indicated to DFS that they only keep transcripts for 10 years. The Subcommittee suggested that, with follow up phone calls to confirm that there are no transcripts, that due diligence has been demonstrated and should be noted for those cases.

Ms. Curtis and the Subcommittee discussed the search for next of kin notifications. Staff from the Virginia Crime Commission has agreed to assist in researching next of kin for two pending notifications. The Subcommittee agreed that notifications should be made to next of kin address in cases where the defendant was executed or is deceased under other circumstances.

The Chair agreed that the future notification letters should be signed by the Board Chair.

The Subcommittee agreed that notification should be sent through the Department of Corrections to inmates to seek referrals for cases where microscopic hair comparison examinations were part of the courtroom testimony. Ms. Curtis explained to Subcommittee that it will take years for the Department to identify all the cases that included microscopic hair comparison examinations as part of the historical case file project. Ms. Herndon suggested that another outreach to attorneys and judges may bring in more cases to review.

Ms. Curtis requested that she be permitted to present for the Subcommittee's consideration the results of the Review Team's June 27, 2018 meeting. Mr. Donoghue moved that the Subcommittee go into a closed session pursuant to Virginia Code §2.2-3711 (A)(35), because the Subcommittee would be discussing specific information from criminal investigative files as part of the Review Team's results, which was seconded by Lt. Col. Russillo and approved by unanimous vote of the Subcommittee.

The Subcommittee met in closed session. Department Counsel Amy Curtis and Board Secretary Carisa Studer, and Jennifer Taylor, Administrative Assistant, remained in the closed session to assist the Subcommittee members with its consideration of the Review Team's results.

The Subcommittee concluded the closed session and reconvened in an open meeting at 2:23 p.m.

A roll call vote was taken of each Subcommittee member to certify that, to the best of each member's knowledge, only exempt information was discussed, and only matters identified in the motion were heard, considered and discussed. The Chair, Mr. Lett, and Lt. Col. Russillo each certified that only exempt information was discussed, and only matters identified in the motion were heard, considered and discussed.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Next Meeting

The next Subcommittee meeting will be held Monday, November 19, 2018 at 1:30 p.m.

Adjournment

- The Chair moved that the meeting of the Subcommittee be adjourned, which was seconded by Mr.
- Lett, and passed by unanimous vote.

The meeting adjourned at 2:26 p.m.